

**California Bay-Delta Public Advisory Committee
Environmental Justice Subcommittee Meeting Summary
July 18, 2002
Resources Building, 1416 Ninth Street, Room 1142
Sacramento, CA
Meeting start: 10:00 a.m.**

- Welcome and Introduction by Martha Guzman, EJ Subcommittee Co-Chair. Martha also welcomed members of the Subcommittee that were joining the meeting via teleconference from the alternate meeting location at the Association of Bay Area Governments' Conference Room in Oakland. (A partial list of attendees is appended to this summary as Attachment 1.)

Integration with CALFED Program Elements

**CALFED Public Affairs – guest speaker:
Margaret Gidding, CALFED Public Affairs Director**

- The Public Affairs Office acts as a liaison between the CALFED Program and the public, interested parties, congressional/legislative representatives, and local elected officials. Communication and outreach vehicles include public meetings, newsletters, annual reports and the CALFED Program web site. Margaret noted that the CALFED Program has recently implemented a monthly electronic newsletter and will soon launch a newly revamped web site.
- The goals of the Public Affairs office include:
 - Public involvement – via two way communication
 - Education – through the delivery of accurate information
 - Support of the CALFED Program – by building both financial and community backing.
- Margaret suggested that she work with the EJ Subcommittee to design a fact sheet that can be used both as a stand-alone information piece and on the EJ Program page of the new web site. A fact sheet on the EJ Program would include such information as applicable state and federal laws, CALFED commitments to EJ, and the EJ work plan. Margaret agreed to provide a draft outline of the fact sheet at the next meeting of the EJ Subcommittee.
- Dan Wermiel, the Acting EJ Coordinator, stated that he has summarized the CALFED Program's accomplishments relative to EJ for use on the web site and in next annual report. He asked for the Subcommittee's input on additional information that should be included in the EJ page of the CALFED Program web site.
- The EJ Subcommittee suggested that a database of EJ community-based organizations be developed for use by the Public Affairs Office, the EJ Subcommittee, and other CALFED programs. Wendy Halverson-Martin, Deputy Director for the CALFED Program, stated that if the EJ Subcommittee could provide the contacts and organizations for the database, the Public Affairs office could put that information in a database. She suggested that Dan Wermiel distribute a form to all Subcommittee members to gather their input on relevant community –based organizations that should go into an EJ contacts database.
- The EJ Subcommittee discussed how to translate public information materials into other languages. Margaret Gidding explained that the contract to provide translation services is currently tied up in CALFED contracting. The contract process was discussed as a major bottleneck in various program efforts. CALTRANS, Cal EPA, and the Department of Social Services were discussed as agencies that might provide translation services. It was also suggested that university students could intern or volunteer their time to provide translation.

CALFED Ecosystem Restoration Program Fish Consumption Study – guest speakers:

Donna Podger, CALFED Ecosystem Restoration Program (ERP)

Alyce Ujihara, Dept. of Health Services (DHS), Environmental Health Investigations Branch

Mimi Johnson, Dept. of Health Services (DHS), Environmental Health Investigations Branch

Handouts: Slide talking points

Draft Work Plan

Public Summary of the San Francisco Bay Seafood Consumption Study

- Donna Podger, CALFED ERP, explained that human health assessment for fish consumption was identified as a priority in the CALFED ROD. Unfortunately, while proposals were solicited for this specific investigation, no proposals were received. Therefore, this effort is a directed action under the CALFED ERP for research and outreach to be completed by DHS' Environmental Health Investigations Branch (EHIB).
- Funding for this project comes from the Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board, the Delta Tributary Mercury Council (DTMC), CALFED Direct Action funding, and in-kind staff support from other agencies. Currently DTMC contracting is nearly complete, the Regional Board contract is in process, and the CALFED contract is still in development.
- Alyce Ujihara, DHS-EHIB Staff outlined the focus and intent of the Delta study. The focus of this study is on the Delta and its tributaries. The intent is to identify highly exposed and sensitive populations, identify high priority areas, determine fish consumption patterns for target populations, describe demographic characteristics of target populations, identify knowledge gaps, identify outreach and education needs and develop education activities, and use a participatory approach that involves stakeholders and local organizations.
- After contracting is complete, DHS-EHIB will begin a scoping phase that includes a needs assessment and the collection of geographic information on anglers and contamination. These tasks will begin soon and continue to the end of the year. Additional tasks including convening a stakeholder advisory group, a needs assessment follow-up, preparation of a draft outreach and education strategy, etc., will begin as soon as Regional Board and CALFED funding are secured.
- DHS-EHIB will model the Delta study on their 1998-2001 San Francisco Bay Seafood Consumption Study. The regional monitoring program was funded by the San Francisco Estuary Institute and consisted of 1300 interviews of anglers at boat/shore fishing access sites. From this study, DHS determined that 1 in 10 surveyed consumed more fish than was advised in the health advisory for San Francisco Bay. EHIB also determined that there was, in general, a poor awareness of health advisories, that certain populations were more highly exposed than others, that many anglers shared fish with women of childbearing age and with children, and that African Americans and Asians were more highly exposed than other populations. Based on their study, DHS recommended that more outreach and education be done, that special emphasis be placed on highly exposed and sensitive populations, that warning signs be posted using a variety of approaches, and that messages are culturally appropriate.
- EHIB is interested in reducing the exposure of Delta anglers to mercury by having consumers limit their exposure to tainted fish species. Mimi Johnson, DHS-EHIB staff, stated that public outreach will be important throughout the Delta study. The outreach efforts will be modeled after what EHIB did in the San Francisco Bay and will include:
 - Direct involvement of affected communities by developing MOUs with Community-Based Organizations (CBOs)
 - Creation of an advisory group to include a variety of different stakeholders in the study process
 - Involvement of the CBOs in the creation of messages, materials, and educational activities
 - Technical assistance by agency staff
 - Pre- and post testing (i.e. after messages are created and distributed, researchers will go back and assess if the messages have initiated a change in behaviors among consumers/anglers)

- Opportunities for EJ Subcommittee involvement in the Delta mercury study include participation in:
 - Planning meetings during the scoping phase (the first meeting will be held this September)
 - Technical/science subcommittee
 - Education/outreach subcommittee
 - Study advisory group
- EJ Subcommittee members identified issues for further investigation regarding fish consumption including:
 - Coordination of the angler surveys with fish tissue analyses
 - Gathering information on other nutrients such as selenium and chromium
 - Including Native American communities in the survey population
 - Coordination with CALFED projects that are investigating whether ecosystem restoration projects are exacerbating the amount of mercury in the Delta
 - Identification of other DHS-sponsored projects/programs that involve EJ issues.

**Office of Planning and Research, Environmental Justice Program – guest speaker:
Sandra-Salazar Thompson, Environmental Justice Project Director**

- The Office of the Governor approaches EJ as a philosophy, not a stand-alone program. The Office of Planning and Research hosts two opportunities for state agency information sharing on EJ issues. The EJ Steering Committee is a staff-level group that meets to share early successes in the EJ programs of various state departments. The directors of many of the state agencies also meet to discuss EJ issues. The next directors' meeting is from 3:00-5:00 p.m. on July 31 at the Employment Development Auditorium (722 Capitol Mall). The public is welcome at all of these meetings.
- Sandra stated that each agency department has named a primary contact for EJ issues.

12:45 p.m. Lunch Break

**1:20 p.m. Presentation by US EPA Environmental Justice Program – Guest Speakers:
Karen Schwinn, Norman Calero, Running Grass, EPA Region 9**

- Karen Schwinn, EPA Region 9, stated that the EPA helped draft the language that is in the CALFED EJ work plan and will provide continued support and training for EJ efforts by the CALFED Program.
- Norman Calero, EPA Region 9 EJ staff, summarized the history of the EJ program within EPA. The EJ program of the EPA assists local community initiatives and provides small grants to implement community-based projects (including EJ and pollution prevention projects). The EJ Office works within EPA on a regional EJ team, to provide training, and to implement EJ considerations into program decisions. The EJ office works with states and other agencies outside of EPA to provide support, to participate on multi-agency work groups, and to provide training.
- The EJ Subcommittee discussed how the reimbursable nature of some state and CALFED grants is a barrier to EJ communities and community-based organizations. Renee Hoyas, Resource Agency staff, offered to chair a task force to examine this issue.
- The EJ Subcommittee inquired whether the EPA has data or GIS capabilities to identify EJ communities. The EPA staff responded that no single tool is used to come up with an EJ map. However, several web sites have that information and a list of these sites was provided at the EPA EJ training. EPA has maps of EJ areas for limited regions; anyone interested can contact Cheryl Henley in Region 9.

- Running Grass, EPA Region 9 EJ staff, outlined EPA's efforts in EJ training. He defined the training as a multifaceted effort that involves a training assessment and a one-, two-, or three-day workshop. Running Grass stated that as the EJ Subcommittee further defines the issues they are working on, additional training would be helpful; he suggested a two to three-day workshop including case studies. He encouraged the Subcommittee to suggest other departments in the CALFED Program and CALFED Agencies that might benefit from EJ training.

2:30 p.m. Resource Issues and Priorities for Subcommittee

Environmental Justice Coordinator Announcement

Handout: Draft Coordinator Position Description/Announcement

- Dan Wermiel announced that the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation is now advertising the Coordinator position. The closing date for applications is July 26. The Subcommittee discussed how the selection would be made and if representatives from the Subcommittee could sit on the selection panel. Dan agreed to find out what rules govern the selection process.

2002-2003 Environmental Justice Workplan and Budget

- The Subcommittee briefly discussed how they should approach setting recommendations for the September 19th meeting of BDPAC. Eugenia Laychak of the CALFED Program advised that any materials that the EJ Subcommittee wanted to include in the BDPAC meeting would need to be submitted to her by September 6. The Subcommittee agreed to spend the majority of their next meeting on formulating recommendations. Martha Guzman, EJ Subcommittee Co-Chair, offered to chair a task force to start to identify recommendations and prepare a draft for discussion at the next meeting of the EJ Subcommittee.

Next meeting of the EJ Subcommittee

- The Subcommittee agreed to meet from 10 a.m. to 3 p.m. on Friday, August 9. The meeting will be held in Room 1131 of the Resources Building, Sacramento. Dan Wermiel will arrange for a site from which Bay Area representatives can participate by teleconference. The morning portion of the meeting will include a presentation on integration by a representative from the CALFED Science Program. The remainder of the meeting will be dedicated to outlining recommendations to BDPAC.

Action Items Chart

| Meeting Participant | Action Item |
|---|--|
| Margaret Gidding, CALFED Public Affairs | Provide a draft outline of an EJ Fact Sheet at the next meeting of the EJ Subcommittee meeting. |
| Dan Wermiel, Acting EJ Coordinator | Distribute a form to all Subcommittee members to gather their input on relevant community-based organizations that should go into an EJ contacts database. |
| EJ Subcommittee Members | Investigate agencies/organizations that would provide translation services for CALFED EJ materials. |
| EJ Subcommittee | Nominate a liaison(s) to work with DHS-EHIB on the Sacramento-San Joaquin Delta fish study. |
| Mimi Johnson, DHS-EHIB staff | Investigate what other DHS project have direct relevance to EJ and CALFED objectives. |
| Renee Hoyas, The Resources Agency | Chair a task force to examine if the reimbursable nature of CALFED grants is an EJ issue. |
| EJ Subcommittee (or portion of) | Work with EPA and OPR to complete an EJ training assessment and training design. |

DRAFT

| | |
|---|--|
| Martha Guzman, EJ Subcommittee Co-Chair | Chair a task force to draft recommendations to BDPAC for review at the next EJ Subcommittee meeting. |
| Dan Wermiel, Acting EJ Coordinator | Advise the EJ Subcommittee on the selection process for the EJ Coordinator position. |
| Dan Wermiel, Acting EJ Coordinator | Identify a teleconference meeting location for the August 9 meeting. |

Attachment 1**BDPAC/Environmental Justice Subcommittee Voluntary Sign-In
July 18, 2002**

| Name | Affiliation |
|-------------------------|---|
| Karen Schwinn | U.S. EPA |
| Adrian Perez | State Water Resources Control Board |
| Bill DuBois | California Farm Bureau Federation |
| Carlos Michelin | Metropolitan Water District of So. California |
| Sarah Ryan | Big Valley Rancheria |
| Olin Webb | BUHP Advocates |
| Dr. Henry Clark | |
| Tamara Bloke | |
| Paola Ramos | Latino Issues Forum |
| Michael Stanley-Jones | Silicon Valley Toxics Coalition |
| Paul Bowers | US Army Corps of Engineers |
| Kristin Carter | CSU Chico |
| Kristen LaVine | Public Affairs Management |
| Sandra Salazar-Thompson | Office of Planning & Research |
| Renee Hoyos | Resource Agency |
| Michelle Stevens | DWR- Comprehensive Study |
| Gemma Daggs | City of Fairfield Public Works Department |
| Margaret Gidding | CALFED Public Affairs |
| Norman Calero | US EPA |
| Alyce Ujihara | CA Dept. of Health Services/EHIB |
| Sam Woodworth | U.S. Dept. of the Interior |
| Tina Lau | U.S. DOI/OEPC |
| Amy Hu | Environmental Justice Coalition for Water |
| Chuck Striglen | Graten Rancheria |
| Robin Freeman | Environmental Justice Coalition for Water |
| Marguerite Naillon | Contra Costa Water District |